



CRITICAL APPRAISAL WORKSHEET 1

AN ARTICLE ON THERAPY

This worksheet should be submitted along with the completed Submission Form to your supervisor. It is based on the articles on therapy from the JAMA series on Users' Guides to the Medical Literature. Reading these articles should be helpful to you in working through this worksheet as it pertains to your key article(s). Feel free to make photocopies. You can also print off additional copies from the CFPC Web Site (www.cfpc.ca/cme/pearls/pearlsmain.asp).

Author(s): _____

Short title: _____

Journal/Year/Volume/ Pages: _____

A. ARE THE STUDY RESULTS VALID?

1. Was the assignment of patients to treatment groups truly randomized? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

2. Were all patients who entered the study accounted for appropriately at the end?
i) Is the number randomized the same as in results? (Try a best case/ worse case scenario.) Yes
 No
ii) Were patients analysed in the groups they were allocated to at the start of the study? Can't tell

3. Were patients, physicians, and those doing the assessments "blind" to treatment? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

4. Was similarity between groups documented?
i) Is there a table of baseline characteristics? Yes
ii) Were differences controlled for in the analysis? No
 Can't tell

5. Aside from the intervention, were the groups treated in the same way? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

B. WHAT WERE THE RESULTS?

1. How large was the treatment effect?

2. How precise was the estimate of the treatment effect?

C. CAN THE RESULTS BE APPLIED TO YOUR PATIENT(S)?

1. Can the results be applied to my patient (care)?

i) Are study patients similar to your patient?

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

2. Were all clinically important outcomes reported?

i) Were the most important outcomes used?

ii) Were quality of life outcomes used? Assessment of adverse effects?

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

3. Are the likely treatment benefits greater than the potential harms and costs?

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

CONCLUSIONS

The results or recommendations are valid (from A).

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

The results are clinically important (from B).

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

The results are relevant to my practice (from C).

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell



CRITICAL APPRAISAL WORKSHEET 2

AN ARTICLE ON A DIAGNOSTIC TEST

This worksheet should be submitted along with the completed Submission Form to your supervisor. It is based on the articles on diagnostic tests from the JAMA series on Users' Guides to the Medical Literature. Reading these articles should be helpful to you in working through this worksheet as it pertains to your key article(s). Feel free to make photocopies. You can also print off additional copies from the CFPC Web Site (www.cfpc.ca/cme/pearls/pearlsmain.asp).

Author(s): _____

Short title: _____

Journal/Year/Volume/ Pages: _____

A. ARE THE STUDY RESULTS VALID?

1. Was there an independent "blind" comparison with a reference standard? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

2. Did the patient sample include an appropriate spectrum of patients to whom the diagnostic test will be applied in clinical practice? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

3. Did the results of the test being evaluated influence the decision to perform the reference standard? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

4. Were the methods for performing the test described in sufficient detail to permit replication? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

B. WHAT WERE THE RESULTS?

1. Consider the pre-test and post-test possibilities.
- i) Are likelihood ratios for the test results presented or data necessary for their calculation provided?

- Yes
 No
 Can't tell

C. CAN THE RESULTS BE APPLIED TO YOUR PATIENT(S)?

1. Will the reproducibility of the test result and its interpretation be satisfactory in my setting?

- Yes
 No
 Can't tell

2. Are the results applicable to my patient?

- Yes
 No
 Can't tell

3. Will the results change my management?

- Yes
 No
 Can't tell

4. Will patients be better off as a result of the test?

- Yes
 No
 Can't tell

CONCLUSIONS

The results or recommendations are valid (from A).

- Yes No Can't tell

The results are clinically important (from B).

- Yes No Can't tell

The results are relevant to my practice (from C).

- Yes No Can't tell



CRITICAL APPRAISAL WORKSHEET 3

AN ARTICLE ON PROGNOSIS OR HARM

This worksheet should be submitted along with the completed Submission Form to your supervisor. It is based on the articles on prognosis and harm from the JAMA series on Users' Guides to the Medical Literature. Reading these articles should be helpful to you in working through this worksheet as it pertains to your key article(s). Feel free to make photocopies. You can also print off additional copies from the CFPC Web Site (www.cfpc.ca/cme/pearls/pearlsmain.asp).

Author(s): _____

Short title: _____

Journal/Year/Volume/ Pages: _____

A. ARE THE STUDY RESULTS VALID?

1. Was there a representative and well-defined sample of patients at a similar point in the course of the disease? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

2. Was follow-up sufficiently long and complete? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

3. Were objective and unbiased outcome criteria used? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

4. Was there adjustment for important prognostic factors? Yes
 No
 Can't tell

B. WHAT WERE THE RESULTS?

1. How large is the likelihood of the outcome event(s) in a specific period of time?

2. How precise are the estimates of likelihood? (Consider 95% C.I.)

C. CAN THE RESULTS BE APPLIED TO YOUR PATIENT(S)?

1. Were the study patients similar to my own?

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

2. Are the results useful for reassuring or counselling patients?

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

CONCLUSIONS

The results or recommendations are valid (from A). Yes No Can't tell

The results are clinically important (from B). Yes No Can't tell

The results are relevant to my practice (from C). Yes No Can't tell



CRITICAL APPRAISAL WORKSHEET 4

AN OVERVIEW, REVIEW OR META ANALYSIS ARTICLE

This worksheet should be submitted along with the completed Submission Form to your supervisor. It is based on the article on overviews from the JAMA series on Users' Guides to the Medical Literature. Reading this article should be helpful to you in working through this worksheet as it pertains to your key article(s). Feel free to make photocopies. You can also print off additional copies from the CFPC Web Site (www.cfpc.ca/cme/pearls/pearlsmain.asp).

Author(s): _____

Short title: _____

Journal/Year/Volume/ Pages: _____

A. ARE THE STUDY RESULTS VALID?	
1. Did the overview address a focused clinical question?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
2. Were the criteria used to select articles for inclusion appropriate?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
3. Is it unlikely that important relevant studies were missed?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
4. Was the validity of the included studies appraised?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
5. Were assessments of studies reproducible?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
6. Were the results similar from study to study?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell

B. WHAT WERE THE RESULTS?

1. What are the overall results of the review?

2. How precise were the results?

C. CAN THE RESULTS BE APPLIED TO YOUR PATIENT(S)?

1. Can the results be applied to my patient (care)?

- Yes
 No
 Can't tell

2. Were all clinically important outcomes considered?

- Yes
 No
 Can't tell

3. Are the benefits worth the harms and costs?

- Yes
 No
 Can't tell

CONCLUSIONS

The results or recommendations are valid (from A).

- Yes No Can't tell

The results are clinically important (from B).

- Yes No Can't tell

The results are relevant to my practice (from C).

- Yes No Can't tell



CRITICAL APPRAISAL WORKSHEET 5

A CLINICAL PRACTICE GUIDELINE

This worksheet should be submitted along with the completed Submission Form to your supervisor. It is based on the articles on clinical practice guidelines from the JAMA series on Users' Guides to the Medical Literature. Reading these articles should be helpful to you in working through this worksheet as it pertains to your key article(s). Feel free to make photocopies. You can also print off additional copies from the CFPC Web Site (www.cfpc.ca/cme/pearls/pearlsmain.asp).

Author(s): _____

Short title: _____

Journal/Year/Volume/ Pages: _____

A. ARE THE STUDY RESULTS VALID?	
1. Were all important options and outcomes clearly specified?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
2. Was an explicit and sensible process used to identify, select and combine evidence?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
3. Was an explicit and sensible process used to consider the relative value of different outcomes?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
4. Is the guideline likely to account for important recent developments?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell
5. Has the guideline been subject to peer review and testing?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell

B. WHAT WERE THE RESULTS?

1. Are practical, clinically important, recommendations made?

2. How strong are the recommendations?

3. What is the impact of uncertainty associated with the evidence and values used in the guidelines?

C. CAN THE RESULTS BE APPLIED TO YOUR PATIENT(S)?

1. Is the primary objective of the guideline consistent with your objective?

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

2. Are the recommendations applicable to your patients?

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

CONCLUSIONS

The results or recommendations are valid (from A).

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

The results are clinically important (from B).

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell

The results are relevant to my practice (from C).

- Yes
- No
- Can't tell